



Council of Technical Education and Vocational Training
Skills Development Project (SDP)
ADB Grant No. 0345

Terms of Reference (TOR) for
Tracer Study

Kathmandu, Nepal

October 2017

1. Background

The Skills Development Project (SDP) is implemented under the ADB Grant (USD 20 M) and Government of Nepal (GON) fund (USD 5 M) which supports the GON to develop a market-responsive and social and gender-responsive Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system by: (i) expanding the number of basic- and mid-level, market-oriented training opportunities; (ii) increasing the quality relevance and efficiency of TEVT provisions; (iii) improving coordination and regulation of the TVET sector and (iv) improving the capacity for effective project management and monitoring and evaluation. A key priority of the project is to match the skills being learnt by TVET trainees with the needs of both the domestic and international labor markets.

The impact of the Project will be increased employability of the Nepalese workforce. Its outcome will be the establishment of a market-responsive and social and gender-inclusive TVET System. The Executive Agency is the Ministry of Education (MOE) and the Council for Technical Education and Vocational Training (CTEVT) is the Implementing Agency. CTEVT established a TVET Sector Development Unit (TSDU) and Project Implementation Unit (PIU) to implement the project.

This tracer study will only focus on output (i) expanded provision of market-oriented training opportunities, and specifically the sub-output which will provide in total 45,000 short-term training places in level-1 and level-2 training programs, for unemployed or underemployed people, at least 40% of whom will be women and at least 30% of whom will be from other disadvantaged groups. Following are the final outcomes of short term training formulated for output (i):

- (a) By 2018, at least 75% of graduates are gainfully employed six months after training (of graduates, 40% are women and 30% from disadvantaged groups).
- (b) By 2018, employer satisfaction with TVET graduates increases to 70%.

Till 31 March 2017, total 20661 participants (6916 or 33.47 % women and 14260 or 69.02 % disadvantaged group) have completed the basic skills training in market demanded occupations. The training programs are provided by Public schools and Private Training and Employment Service Providers (TESP). In the first round five TESP were contracted for 14040 places in level-1 training programs. Likewise, MOU was signed with 19 CTEVT constituent public schools to deliver level 1 skill training and employment services for 6000 places. Similarly, MOU was signed with 17 CTEVT constituent Schools and 14 TECS Schools to deliver level 2 skills Training and Employment services for 3580 places. For the second round of skill training through private sector TESP, six TESP have been procured and contracted for 17300 training places.

2. Objectives of the Assignment

The consulting firm will evaluate the sustainability of employment of trainees who finished the short term training programs (Level 1 & Level 2) of the project, their satisfaction with the training programs and employers' satisfaction with the skills and knowledge of the trainees.

3. Scope of Services, Task and Expected Deliverables

3.1 Scope of Works

The consulting firm will undertake the following:

- i. review relevant documents to become familiar with the objectives of the short-term training sub-output of the SDP, and the precise requirements of tracer study;
- ii. work with the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) monitoring staff to develop the surveys, Focus Group Discussion (FGD) and training provider questionnaires, and the analysis plan for the final report;
- iii. train an adequate number of experienced enumerators and field supervisors and provide them, in collaboration with the PIU RMOs, orientation and training on the pilot testing and refinement and coding of the survey, FGD and training provider questionnaires;
- iv. test the validity and reliability of the questionnaire using a random sample of 100 trainees.
- v. conduct interviews using the survey questionnaires with a finalized and statistically valid sample of trainees and their employers taking into account possibilities for disaggregation (gender, ethnic groups, sector, occupation, district and region);
- vi. check a 10% random sample of completed questionnaires at the field level so that corrections can be made to ensure the integrity of the data collected;
- vii. prepare and enter data into the data base using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences or other relevant software, and generate output tables based on the analysis plan;
- viii. conduct the FGDs and the training provider enquiries using the guide questions and carefully observing the guidelines for conducting FGDs and enquiries;
- ix. transcribe the FGDs and enter the transcripts in Nvivo, Atlas.ti or other relevant software and analyze the data based on the analysis plan;
- x. prepare a brief report on proceedings of each FGD and training provider enquiry conducted and a summary report for all the FGDs and training provider enquiries;
- xi. prepare a draft report on the tracer study, integrating findings from the survey, FGDs and the training provider enquiries;
- xii. present tracer study findings, in English, to the PIU staff, CTEVT, MOE; and
- xiii. prepare final report, in English, on the tracer study taking into consideration comments and suggestions from the PIU staff.

3.2 Required Methodology for Study

The tracer study will assess the training and employment performance aspects of the project. The tracer study aims at all trainees who are graduated. It does not matter whether they passed the skills test or not.

- a) The results of the tracer study will aim to:
 - i. inform the PIU/CTEVT, the MOE and the ADB whether the training providers have actually been successful in achieving a 75% employment rate of the trainees enrolled, at incomes of at least: first round Level 1 > NRs 4,600, second round Level 1 > NRs 9,700 and for level 2 in both rounds NRs 10,000;
 - ii. collect feedback from the trainees on the quality and relevance of the training, particularly for women and other disadvantaged groups;

- iii. gather information of employers on the quality and relevance of the training particularly for women and other disadvantaged groups;
 - iv. identify areas for improvement based on quantitative results showing employment rates, income levels and general satisfaction, and qualitative results based on trainees' and employers' perceptions, and
 - v. draw up recommendations to improve the training quality of the project, relevance and effectiveness.
- b) As stated above, the tracer study must use both quantitative and qualitative approaches. The quantitative approach must involve short, direct interviews taking a statistically valid sample across occupation-wise groups of trainees from the first and second round of trainees trained by the project. These interviews at the place of employment will determine the fact of current employment, the type of employment and the income, but also the development of life skills during the training, received support from training institute to find a job or start own business and general satisfaction with the training. While at the workplace the employer will also answer a short set of questions to measure the employer's satisfaction with the skills and knowledge of the trainees. For every employed trainee an employer should fill a questionnaire. For trainees who are unemployed or self-employed the employer's part of the questionnaire can left blank.
- c) The qualitative approach involves focus group discussions (FGDs) with employers and different groups of trainees. The discussions with employers will assess how satisfied they are with the skills of the trained trainees, the discussions with the trainees will inquire more in depth what the training experience was like and determine ways to improve it. Findings from the two approaches, together with some secondary information observing training centers and information from the project monitoring staff, will be triangulated in order to draw conclusions and make recommendations.
- d) The survey will take place over each of the 5 development regions separately so that results of training being conducted by the individual training providers can be compared. There will also be disaggregation of private and public training providers. Disaggregation will also be done based on gender and disadvantaged groups as well as the trades themselves. The survey will use a stratified sampling method to ensure correct representation on gender, disadvantaged groups and trades. The final sample size should be based on the number of trainees who finished their training six month or longer ago using a confidence level of 95% and a margin of error of 1% for the whole population and a margin of error of 5% at disaggregated levels. Whichever is bigger will define the final sample size.
- e) A pre-tested survey questionnaire in Nepali will be the main data collection instrument. The questionnaire will consist of two parts. One part will be filled by the trainee and the second part by their employer if they have one. Indicative questions for the trainee part would confirm the trainee name and course attended, course completion date, skill test pass/fail, details of the employment, income, employment and training satisfaction, satisfaction with support provided by training provider to find employment and suggestions for improvement in the selection, training and placement methodology. Indicative questions for the employer are confirmation of the income, satisfaction of trainee's skills and knowledge, match between trainee's skills and market demands and suggestions for improvement of the training. Filled-up questionnaires will be checked for completeness and accuracy and data will be encoded and entered into the computer using, for example, Statistical Package for the Social Sciences software and output tables generated as needed for analysis.

- f) Five FGDs will be conducted per region. In each region there will be one FGD (8-10 participants) for each trade. In these FGDs there should be a statistical representation of women and trainees from disadvantaged groups. In each region one separate FGD will be organized for female trainees only. Furthermore one or two FGDs will be organized in each region for employers with at least three representatives per trade. The FGDs will be conducted following a set of pre-tested guide questions in Nepali. The questions will cover the same topics as the survey but will be open ended questions that will elicit discussion among the participants of the FGD to enable a more in depth exploration of the topics. The FGD participants will be different from the survey respondents. Guidelines on how to conduct the FGDs will be strictly observed.
- g) Training provider enquiries of narrow scope will be undertaken to assess the general facilities of a sample of about 10 training 'event' locations.

3.3 Duration of Service Delivery

Duration of assignment will be 6 months from the date of signing of the contract.

4. Team Composition and Qualification Requirements

The tracer study firm will be selected based on the ADB's Guidelines on the Use of Consulting Services following Consultant Qualification Selection (CQS) procedure.

4.1 Qualification Requirements of Key and Non-Key Experts

A. Key Experts

Team Leader (Monitoring and Evaluation Expert) (66 days):

- i. Master's degree in education, development studies, statistics, social sciences or a related field;
- ii. A doctoral degree in any one of the above disciplines would be an added advantage;
- iii. preferably 15 years general working experience;
- iv. preferably 10 years specific experience in conducting and leading quantitative and qualitative research in the field of education, preferably TVET, or a related field;
- v. understanding of the education and TVET sector in Nepal;
- vi. excellent report writing and communication skills in English.

Quantitative Research Specialist (66 days):

- i. Master's degree in education, statistics, economics, social sciences or a related field;
- ii. preferably 10 years general working experience;
- iii. preferably 5 years specific experience in conducting quantitative research in the field of education, preferably TVET, or a related field;
- iv. experience with SPSS or other statistic software packages;
- v. excellent report writing skills in English.

Technical Education and Vocational Training (TEVT)/Qualitative Research Expert (88 days):

- i. Master's degree in education, economics, social sciences or a related field;
- ii. preferably 7 years working experience in TEVT;
- iii. preferably 3 years specific experience in conducting qualitative research in the field of education or a related field;
- iv. experience with Atlas.ti, Nvivo or other relevant software;
- v. excellent report writing skills in English.

B. Non-Key Experts

Enumerators (15 Nos., 66 days each):

- i. Bachelor's degree in a field relevant to the assignment;
- ii. 1 year of working experience, but if the enumerator has field work experiences in university program, it does not necessarily require actual working experience.
- iii. good quantitative and/or qualitative data collection skills.
- iv. basic knowledge of IT.

4.2 Detail TOR of Key and Non-Key Experts

A. Key Experts

Team Leader (Monitoring and Evaluation Expert):

- i. lead a consultant team comprising a quantitative research specialist, a TVET expert and 15 enumerators;
- ii. review relevant documents to become familiar with the objectives of the short-term training sub-output of the SDP, and the precise requirements of tracer study;
- iii. develop the overall research framework, including analysis plans, for the tracer study in collaboration with the PIU;
- iv. work with the TVET expert on developing the instruments of the qualitative part of the tracer study;
- v. select and train an adequate number of experienced enumerators and field supervisors and provide them orientation and training on facilitating and transcribing the FGDs;
- vi. lead the analysis of the qualitative data collected during the FGDs;
- vii. supervise the quantitative part of the tracer study;
- viii. ensure quality and timely completion of the research design, data entry, data analyses and reports;
- ix. prepare a draft report on the tracer study, integrating findings from the survey, FGDs and the training provider enquiries;
- x. present tracer study findings, in English, to the PIU staff, CTEVT, MOE; and
- xi. prepare final report, in English, on the tracer study taking into consideration comments and suggestions from the PIU staff.

Quantitative Research Specialist:

- i. work closely with and report to the Team Leader on all matter of the quantitative part of the tracer study project;
- ii. review relevant documents to become familiar with the objectives of the short-term training sub-output of the SDP, and the precise requirements of tracer study;
- iii. develop a questionnaire to collect data on (1) trainees' employment, income and satisfaction with the training program and (2) employers' satisfaction with the level of skills and knowledge of the trainees;
- iv. develop manual on how to conduct the survey;
- v. develop analysis plan for the quantitative part of the tracer study;
- vi. train an adequate number of experienced enumerators and field supervisors and provide them, in collaboration with the PIU RMOs, orientation and training on the pilot testing and refinement and coding of the survey;
- vii. test the validity and reliability of the questionnaire using a random sample of 100 trainees.
- viii. supervise the enumerators in conducting the interviews using the survey questionnaires with a finalized and statistically valid sample of trainees and their employers;
- ix. check a 10% random sample of completed questionnaires at the field level so that corrections can be made to ensure the integrity of the data collected;
- x. prepare and enter data into the data base using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences or other relevant software, and generate output tables based on the analysis plan;
- xi. contribute to the draft and final report.

Technical Education and Vocational Training (TEVT)/Qualitative Research Expert:

- i. work closely with and report to the Team Leader on all matter of the qualitative part of the tracer study project;
- ii. review relevant documents to become familiar with the objectives of the short-term training sub-output of the SDP, and the precise requirements of tracer study;
- iii. ensure the TVET context is well reflected in the research design and report;
- iv. support the quantitative researcher in developing the questionnaire;
- v. develop, in collaboration with the team leader, leading questions for the three types of FGDs and a manual on how to conduct the FGDs;
- vi. supervise the enumerators in conducting FGDs;
- vii. check the transcript of enumerator's first FGD and provide feedback if necessary;
- viii. ensure all FGDs are transcribed in the correct way and the transcripts are entered in Atlas.ti, Nvivo or other relevant software;
- ix. support the team leader in coding and interpreting the data of the FGDs;
- x. prepare observation guidelines to assess the general facilities of training providers;
- xi. conduct observations at training providers to assess the general facilities;
- xii. contribute to the draft and final report.

B. Non-Key Experts

Enumerator:

- i. work closely with and report to the Quantitative and/or Technical Education and Vocational Training expert on all matter of the data collection the enumerator contributes to;
- ii. participate in training on collecting data using the developed survey and/or guidelines for the different types of FGDs;
- iii. develop a feasible planning to collect all data on time;
- iv. collect data using the correct instruments;
- v. enter data in the required database for analysis;

5. Reporting Requirements and Time Schedules for Deliverables

The firm will deliver the following:

- i. Inception report: within 15 days of contract signing;
- ii. Developed instruments, manual on how to use the instruments and analysis plan within one month of contract signing;
- iii. All data entered in databases before submission of draft report;
- iv. Draft Report (soft copy and at least 3 hard copies) within one week of completion of assignment;
- v. Final Report (Soft copy and 3 hard copies): within two weeks of completion of assignment.

6. Client Input and Counterpart Personnel

The SDP will facilitate the Consultant as below:

- Provide CTEVT approved curricula and/or NSTB OSU standards for both the technical training and business development training.
- Provide CTEVT approved minimum training facility requirement
- Detail Guidelines for training and employment service and database formats.
- Miscellaneous support documentation via the project website.
- Gender and Social Inclusion (GESI) guidelines and training materials.

7. Client will provide the following inputs, project data and reports to facilitate preparation of proposal: N/A